# System of Restorative Justice and Juvenile Justice in India: a Brief Comparative Study with Latin American System

Archana Vashishth

 https://orcid.org/0000-0002-3420-6459
 School of Legal Studies, Apeejay Satya University Email address: archana1679@gmail.com

Sakshi Dudeja

https://orcid.org/0009-0008-4375-1660
Assistant Professor, School of Legal Studies, Apeejay Stya University, Sohna, Gurugram
Email address: sakshidudeja59@gmail.com

Teena

https://orcid.org/0000-0002-2712-4535 G.D Goenka University, Gurugram India Email address: teena444parmar@gmail.com

> Received: January 23rd, 2022 Accepted: March 7th, 2022

**Abstract:** Justice everywhere is threatened by injustice anywhere. After the Nirbhaya case verdict in Delhi, the State was accused of being lenient with one of the juvenile offenders; this may have been the cause of the public outcry. Consequently, the Juvenile Justice (Care and Protection) Act, (JJ Act) was passed by India in 2015. Children who commit horrible crimes cannot be dealt with lightly. However, as has been the case in the West, placing them in adult prisons would turn them into hard-ened criminals and repeat offenders. "Old enough to do the crime, young enough to do the time," says the adage. Those who commit crimes must serve their sentences. The child activists contend that the Act is founded on the concepts of retribution and vengeance and has overturned all previous good laws. Children need food, not impediments to their growth. They require our society's compassion rather than the harshness of the law. Restorative justice is a welcome idea. What is required is a shift in perspective, a readiness to prioritize victims in criminal proceedings, and an understanding that mending relationships and undoing harm are crucial components of the criminal justice system. Therefore, rather than simply passing judgment, it is

*Mexican Law Review*, New Series, vol. XVI, num. 2, January - June 2024, pp. 131-143 ISSN: 1870-0578 Esta obra está bajo una Licencia Creative CommonsAtribución-NoComercial-SinDerivar 4.0 Internacional, IIJ-UNAM.

Universidad Nacional Autónoma de México, IIJ-BJV, 2024 hhttps://revistas.juridicas.unam.mx/index.php/mexican-law-review/issue/archive our responsibility to uplift the weak, mend the broken, and comfort the grieving. The article focuses on youth crime kinds and causes, factors that lead to crime and restorative justice. This article also focuses on comparative analysis of Indian restorative justice system with Latin American restorative justice system in juvenile cases. **Keywords:** Juvenile Justice, Restorative Justice, Crime, Indian Laws, Latin American Laws.

**Resumen:** La justicia en todas partes se ve amenazada por la injusticia en cualquier lugar. Después del veredicto del caso Nirbhaya en Delhi, se acusó al Estado de ser indulgente con uno de los delincuentes juveniles; esto pudo haber sido la causa de la indignación pública. En consecuencia, la Ley de Justicia Juvenil (Cuidado y Protección) fue promulgada por India en 2015. Los niños que cometen crímenes horribles no pueden ser tratados ligeramente. Sin embargo, como ha sucedido en Occidente, ponerlos en prisiones para adultos los convertiría en criminales endurecidos y reincidentes. Un dicho popular resume esta preocupación: "Lo suficientemente mayores para cometer el crimen, lo suficientemente jóvenes para cumplir la condena". Quienes cometen crímenes deben cumplir sus condenas. Los activistas en favor de los derechos de los niños sostienen que la ley se basa en los conceptos de retribución y venganza, y ha derogado todas las leyes anteriores beneficiosas. Los niños necesitan comida, no obstáculos para su crecimiento. Requieren la compasión de nuestra sociedad en lugar de la dureza de la ley. La justicia restaurativa es una idea bienvenida. Lo que se necesita es un cambio de perspectiva, una disposición para priorizar a las víctimas en los procedimientos penales, y la comprensión de que reparar relaciones y deshacer el daño son componentes cruciales del sistema de justicia penal. Por lo tanto, en lugar de simplemente emitir un juicio, es nuestra responsabilidad elevar a los débiles, reparar lo roto y consolar a los afligidos. El artículo se centra en los tipos y causas de delitos juveniles, los factores que llevan al crimen y la justicia restaurativa. También se enfoca en un análisis comparativo del sistema de justicia restaurativa en India con el sistema de justicia restaurativa latinoamericano en casos juveniles. Palabras clave: Justicia juvenil, justicia restaurativa, delincuencia, derecho de la India, derecho latinoamericano.

Summary: I. Introduction. II. Types of Juvenile Crimes. III. Causes of Youth Crimes. IV. What is Restorative Justice? V. Restorative Justice for Juvenile Offenders. VI. Restorative Programs for Juvenile Offenders. VII. Indian Restorative Justice Applications. VIII. The Juvenile Justice (Care and Protection of Children) Act, 2015. IX. Restorative Approach in Latin America Laws for Juveniles. X. A Comparative Study with Latin American System. XI. Conclusion.

## I. Introduction

In an aging world, India is the youngest nation. More than half of us are under the age of 25. Although it is our duty to ensure that these children have an education and a job, this could be good news for us. Given that these youngsters are making press headlines for the wrong reasons, the situation in India right now appears hopeless. School lads fight, and as a result, one of them dies; a teenager

132 Vashishth / Dudeja / Teena
 System of Restorative Justice and Juvenile Justice in India...

kills two people only to appear six months later on a dancing reality show; such news makes us uneasy.

The Latin word "Juvenis," which means "young," is the root of the English word "juvenile." Section 2(k) of the Juvenile Justice (Care and Protection of Children) Act of 2000 uses the terms "juvenile" or "kid" to refer to anyone who is under the age of 18.<sup>1</sup> A juvenile who is accused of committing a crime and was under the age of 18 when the alleged crime was allegedly committed is referred to as a "juvenile in dispute with the law." The term "restorative justice," first used by Albert Eglash in 1977, focuses on viewing crime as a wrong done to people, not just as an infringement of the law. John Baithwaite emphasizes healing through restitution, and reintegration of offenders into society. Best results are obtained when all parties involved work together.

1. Who is a juvenile

A juvenile is a person who has not yet reached the legal age, which is typically 18 years old in most countries. Juveniles are considered to be in a stage of development and are therefore subject to special laws and procedures that are designed to protect their rights and promote their welfare. In the context of the criminal justice system, juveniles who are accused of committing crimes may be treated differently than adult offenders, with a greater emphasis on rehabilitation and reintegration into society. The specific age range and legal status of juveniles may vary from country to country.

The Latin word "Juvenis," which means "young," is the root of the English word "juvenile." Section 2(k) of the JJ Act of 2000 defines a "juvenile" or "kid" as a person who is under the age of eighteen.<sup>2</sup> A juvenile who is accused of committing a crime and was under the age of 18 when the alleged crime was allegedly committed is referred to as a "juvenile in dispute with the law." <sup>3</sup>

## **II. Types of Juvenile Crimes**

- 1) Minor offenses, such as driving infractions,
- 2) Offenses related to property
- 3) Major traffic infractions such as car theft and hit-and-run incidents
- 4) Addiction to drugs and alcohol affecting other people,
- 5) Physical harm, such as assaults on women, murder, abduction.

 $^3$  Id.

Mexican Law Review, New Series, vol. XVI, num. 2, January - June 2024, pp. 131-143 ISSN: 1870-0578

Esta obra está bajo una Licencia Creative CommonsAtribución-NoComercial-SinDerivar 4.0 Internacional, IIJ-UNAM.

> Universidad Nacional Autónoma de México, IIJ-BJV, 2024 hhttps://revistas.juridicas.unam.mx/index.php/mexican-law-review/issue/archive

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> Section 2(k) of the Juvenile Justice (Care and Protection of Children) Act of 2000.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> Section 2(k) of the JJ Act of 2000

## **III. Causes of Youth Crimes**

#### 1. Biological Causes

Delinquency may result from biological issues related to speech and hearing impairment, irritability, excessive strength, and others.

#### 2. Socio-Environmental Causes

1. Migration: When a person flees their own country due to war, terrorism, genocide, ethnic cleansing, or natural disasters, they are in a dangerous situation and forced to commit crimes to meet their fundamental necessities.

2. Cultural crossroads: Cultural tensions between locals and immigrants lead to deviant behavior and a sharp rise in crime.

3. Family background: The family unit plays a significant role in shaping the children's personalities. The development of the child to face reality is encouraged by a functionally competent household. In their early years, children are emotionally reliant on their parents.<sup>4</sup>

4. Socio-economic conditions : Crime rates rise as a result of poverty. Money has become the standard for success in modern culture. Insecurities and animosity have always been products of poverty. Money makes it simple to conceal the crimes committed in the elite social circles. It is believed that the wealth gap plays a significant role in encouraging teenage crime.<sup>5</sup>

5. Children seeking refuge in the virtual world: Children are addicted to their PS4s and Xbox 360s, so they are never seen playing outside. They are lost in the world of Clash of Clans or Pokémon Go. They look for safety in the virtual world, where they can exert complete control over the avatars as they choose. These kids are on the receiving end of orders from parents, teachers, and senior citizens, much to their resentment, in real life. On the internet, there is also an information overload. Today's child is weak and easily exposed to inappropriate material or obscene films with the press of a button.

6. Peer influence: Children are open to taking chances and are influenced by their peers. They frequently make poor decisions.

## **IV. What is Restorative Justice?**

Restorative justice is a system of justice that focuses on repairing the harm caused by a crime or conflict, rather than simply punishing the offender.<sup>6</sup> It is a

134

Vashishth / Dudeja / Teena

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>4</sup> Dr. Saroj Choudhary, Juvenile delinquency: Elementary concepts, causes and prevention, 5 *INTERNATIONAL JOURNAL OF HUMANTIES AND SOCIAL SCIENCE RESEARCH*, 3, 55 (2017)

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>5</sup> Id.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>6</sup> PAUL MCCOLD AND TED WACHTEL, IN PURSUIT OF PARADIGM: A THEORY OF RESTORATIVE

victim-centered approach that seeks to involve all parties affected by the harm in finding a solution that addresses their needs and promotes healing and reconciliation. Restorative justice views crime as a violation of relationships and community, rather than solely as a violation of the law. It emphasizes the importance of bringing together the offender, the victim, and any other affected parties to participate in a facilitated dialogue aimed at understanding the impact of the crime and finding a way to repair the harm caused.

This may include apologies, restitution, community service, or other forms of reparative action. Restorative justice can be used in a variety of settings, including criminal justice, schools, workplaces, and community organizations. It is often used as an alternative to traditional punitive measures, such as imprisonment or fines, although it can also be used in conjunction with these measures. Overall, restorative justice seeks to promote accountability, healing, and reconciliation, while also addressing the underlying causes of crime and conflict in order to prevent future harm.

In other words, Restorative justice is a system of justice that focuses on rehabilitating the offender and restoring the harm done to the victim and community. In the context of juvenile justice, restorative justice aims to address the underlying issues that lead to juvenile delinquency and prevent recidivism. In this critical analysis, we will examine the implementation and effectiveness of restorative justice systems for juveniles in India and Latin American countries.

The term "restorative justice" was first used by Albert Eglash in 1977 in an article titled "Beyond Restitution: Creative Restitution."<sup>7</sup> Restorative justice uses the chance to make apologies to the victim by viewing crime as a hurt or wrong done to people rather than just as an infringement against the law or a defiance of the State.<sup>8</sup> Restorative justice, according to John Baithwaite, stresses healing via both literal and symbolic restitution. It places a strong emphasis on victims and offenders regaining their self-respect and assimilating into society<sup>9</sup>. A justice principle known as restorative justice emphasizes healing the suffering caused by criminal action. The best results are obtained when all parties involved work together. In general, this process results in changes in individuals and interpersonal connections within communities.<sup>10</sup>

There are three main components to the restorative justice process, i.e.:

Mexican Law Review, New Series, vol. XVI, num. 2, January - June 2024, pp. 131-143 ISSN: 1870-0578

Esta obra está bajo una Licencia Creative CommonsAtribución-NoComercial-SinDerivar 4.0 Internacional, IIJ-UNAM.

JUSTICE (jan.27, 2023,11:40AM) available at: <u>https://biblioteca.cejamericas.org/bitstream/han-dle/2015/2163/paradigm.pdf?sequence=1&isAllowed=y</u>

 $<sup>^7</sup>$   $\,$  Christian B. N. Gade, "Restorative Justice": History of the Term's International and Danish Use 28 (2018)

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>8</sup> Avaible at: <u>http://burnishedlawjournal.in/wp-content/uploads/2021/03/Restorative-Jus-</u> <u>tice-in-India-A-Study%E2%80%9D-Ramesh-Kumar-LL.M-Student-Galgotias-University.pdf</u>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>9</sup> Kriti Johri, Restorative Justice Vis-a Viz Victim Offender mediation, available at: <u>https://www.slideshare.net/kritijohri/restorative-justice-in-india</u>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>10</sup> Centre for Justice & Reconciliation: Washington, DC 20041 USA. available at: <u>http://</u><u>restorativejustice.org/restorativejustice/about-restorative-justice/tutorial-intro-to-restorative-justice/#sthash.kGPyU2is.dpbs</u>

(1) Justice entails healing the harm caused by crime.

 $\left(2\right)$  Bringing the parties together to make a decision together is the best course of action.

 $\left(3\right)$  This has the potential to drastically alter people, their relationships, and communities.

The government's duty is to uphold the law, and the community's duty is to foster peace, according to the restorative justice process.<sup>11</sup>

1. Key Principles of Restorative Justice

According to the guiding premise of restorative justice, "Crime causes harm and justice should focus on repairing that harm." The parties most impacted by the crime ought to be able to take part in finding a solution.<sup>12</sup> The two main components of the justice system are the victim and the community. Helping the victim should be the top priority in the pursuit of justice. According to the restorative justice process, it helps the offender understand the seriousness of the crime he committed, and it is always the obligation of the government to uphold the law and of the community to promote peace.<sup>13</sup>

## V. Restorative Justice for Juvenile Offenders

The Juvenile Justice Act grants several privileges to juveniles, including to those who have been found out or are confirmed to have engaged in significant wrongdoing. The stated objectives of the Act are to "provide the best treatment, assuredness, and rehabilitation by taking into consideration their optimization requirements, and by accepting a child-friendly framework in the dispute resolution as well as disposition of matters to the highest advantage of young-sters and for their protracted restoration as well as 'rehabilitation.' In order to promote 'the purpose of justice,' the Act grants the Juvenile Justice Board (JJB), which is composed of an Experienced Magistrate and two Social Workers who sit on a court, the authority to request a multidisciplinary investigation into juvenile wrongdoing." The JJB must therefore also consider open intrigue as well as concerns over potential casualties.

Juveniles who are not released on guard are initially placed in the neighborhood of a facility called the Observation Home (OH), pending request. This is done in order to characterize and isolate the adolescents so that they can all receive the necessary care and assurance while in the Home. Here, along with age, physical condition, and mental status, the level of alleged offense is also

136

Vashishth / Dudeja / Teena

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>11</sup> Pawan Kumar, Restorative Justice in India: A study (Dec, 22, 2022) available at <u>http://burnishedlawjournal.in/wp-content/uploads/2021/03/Restorative-Justice-in-India-A-Study%E2%80%9D-Ramesh-Kumar-LLM-Student-Galgotias-University.pdf</u>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>12</sup> Id.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>13</sup> Id.

taken into consideration. Throughout the investigation period, children who are alleged to have committed a real crime might also be placed somewhere safer than the OH. Depending on the adolescents' age, the type of reported offense, and their physical and mental health, the State Governments have the authority to enact regulations that permit the placement and loneliness of teenagers in Special Homes (SH) (institutions where an adolescent may be placed at the JJB's last request).

## VI. Restorative Programs for Juvenile Offenders

For usage with young people who are in legal trouble, beneficial equity methods are frequently produced in numerous places. These initiatives have often served as the foundation of projects for responsible adults that have improved as a result. In stark contrast to more formal and demeaning juvenile equity efforts, remedial projects provide some real and effective alternatives. They are especially helpful for advancing deterrent measures and for providing viable alternatives to laws that would rob a kid of their independence because of their educational value. Numerous such programs offer unique chances to create a support system for young people who are in legal trouble.<sup>14</sup> Many times it is simple to obtain public financing for activities that promote youth equity. Adolescent equity legislation is particularly supportive of the creation of youth-directed projects in several countries.

It is possible to create a substantial number of these projects in conformity with remedial and participatory equity standards. In addition, multiple initiatives that have developed in schools or among groups and are wholly independent of the criminal equity framework can provide a platform for the community to respond to minor infractions and conflicts in a way that is educational rather than legally criminalizing it. Presently, there are a number of programs in the area in school systems that assist a reaction (peer intercession, fight for survival persistence drifts, etc.) to minor youngster's wrongs (such as battles, brutal hassling, small thefts, destruction of school's property, and extortion of pocket money), that may have in some way led to the protest of a criminal offense and equal involvement.<sup>15</sup>

# 1. Family Group Conferencing

The victim, the offender, the victim's family, friends, and other important supporters of both the victim and the offender get together in family group conferencing to resolve the criminal episode. A trained facilitator convenes influenced

Mexican Law Review, New Series, vol. XVI, num. 2, January - June 2024, pp. 131-143 ISSN: 1870-0578 Esta obra está bajo una Licencia Creative CommonsAtribución-NoComercial-SinDerivar 4.0 Internacional, IIJ-UNAM.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>14</sup> MANU SINGH & PURNIMA BHARDWAJ, RESTORATIVE JUSTICE UNDER JUVENILE JUSTICE SYSTEM (Nov. 23, 2022) available at: <u>https://thelawbrigade.com/criminal-law/</u>restorative-justice-under-juvenile-justice-system/

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>15</sup> Id.

groups to discuss how they and others have been harmed by the transgression and how the damage can be rectified.<sup>16</sup> To participate in a family group gathering, the offender must accept responsibility for the offense. All the investment is willful. The facilitator ensures that everyone participating can speak openly and honestly about the circumstances surrounding the wrongdoing and its impact. The facilitator is also responsible for keeping the meeting under control and reasonable for all parties involved. Both the victim and the offender must agree to the compensation, which is a crucial component of the meeting.

2. Restorative Schools/Therapeutic Schools

Helpful measures are being implemented in Minnesota's school districts as an alternative to suspension and expulsion. In order to handle injuries caused by bullying and provocation, disruptions in the classroom, ongoing participation concerns, and terrorist threats, school districts have modified their sentencing procedures and the way victims and guilty parties are exchanged.<sup>17</sup>

# **VII. Indian Restorative Justice Applications**

That crime victims and the pain of the perpetrator's offspring do not compel the attention of the law, according to Krishna Lyer, J., is a flaw in our legal system. "In actuality, victim compensation is still our criminal law's tipping point".<sup>18</sup> Having said that, India should make every effort to impose restorative justice as a nation with deeply ingrained ideals of Ahimsa and Satyagraha.

Moreover, it is commonly established that violence has a strong correlation to isolation.<sup>19</sup> This is deleterious to the physical and mental wellbeing of the convicts, as are other flaws in the Indian prison system, including torture, overcrowding, and inadequate health and medical care.<sup>20</sup> As a result, rather than becoming better and being rehabilitated, the prisoner becomes even worsemannered than when he first arrived.

It is crucial that the legal system adopts as much of the restorative justice method as is feasible given the shortcomings, flaws, and disadvantages of the Indian criminal justice system, as well as the advantages and long-term benefits of the restorative justice system. The following are two areas where the application of restorative justice can positively impact:

138

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>16</sup> Id.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>17</sup> Id.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>18</sup> Rattan Singh vState of Punjab (1979) 4SCC71

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>19</sup> JSTOR-Isolation, Powerlessness, and Violence: A Study of Attitudes and Participation in the Watts Riot H. Edward Ransford.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>20</sup> Available at: <u>https://www.hrw.org/sites/default/files/reports/INDIA914.pdf</u>

## 1. Juvenile Delinquency

It was determined in the case Re: Exploitation of Children in Orphanages in the State of Tamil Nadu vs. Union of India and Others. "A child in dispute with the law who is also a youngster in need of care and protection cannot undergo any meaningful rehabilitation unless the fundamental components and concepts of restorative justice are acknowledged and applied."<sup>21</sup> Therefore, implementing restorative justice for the numerous reasons listed above is in compliance with the Juvenile Justice (Care and Protection of Children) Act, 2015.

Additionally, there are numerous ways to distinguish the juvenile brain from the adult brain. For instance, a human's prefrontal cortex does not fully mature until they are in their mid-20s. This undoubtedly widens the difference in logical decision-making, impulse control, thinking, and other skills. These elements should unquestionably be taken into account when assessing a juvenile's legal culpability<sup>22</sup>. Alternatives that provide juveniles a second opportunity have a beneficial impact on their moral development and are crucial for the expansion and development of society.

## 2. Victims of Domestic Abuse

Domestic abusers are frequently familiar faces, such as members of the immediate family or other close relatives. There is a higher need for discussion to help both parties comprehend each other's positions and settle the dispute that the offense has caused in circumstances where the victim knows the perpetrator. Restorative justice has been highlighted to enable the following: *i*. victims to participate and determine an appropriate reaction to the violent acts; *ii*. new standards and norms to be established for the community at large based on the results of restorative justice meetings.<sup>23</sup> A victim of domestic violence may choose to participate in restorative justice while also being willing to pursue legal action against the perpetrator at the same time, which should be acknowledged given the seriousness and regularity of such cases.

# VIII. The Juvenile Justice (Care and Protection of Children) Act, 2015

It is the primary legislation governing juvenile justice in India. The act recognizes the importance of restorative justice and provides for the establishment

*Mexican Law Review*, New Series, vol. XVI, num. 2, January - June 2024, pp. 131-143 ISSN: 1870-0578 Esta obra está baia una Licancia Creativa Commons Atribución NaComarcial SinDerivar 4.0

 $<sup>^{21}\,</sup>$  Re: Exploitation of Children in Orphanages in the State of Tamil Nadu vs. Union of India (UOI) and Ors. Manu/SC/0577/2017

 $<sup>^{22}\;</sup>$  American Bar Association: Understanding the Adolescent Brain and Legal Culpability – Morgan Tyler

 $<sup>^{23}\,</sup>$  Restorative Justice and Domestic Violence: Some Exploratory Thoughts – Hema Hargovan

of Juvenile Justice Boards (JJBs) in every district. JJBs are tasked with ensuring that restorative justice measures are implemented for juveniles in conflict with the law.

However, the implementation of restorative justice in India has been limited due to a lack of resources and training for JJBs. Many JJBs do not have the necessary infrastructure or staff to implement restorative justice measures effectively. Moreover, there is a lack of awareness among the public and legal professionals about restorative justice, which hinders its wider implementation.

#### IX. Restorative Approach in Latin America Laws for Juveniles

The focus of restorative justice is on showing remorse for the harm done by criminal activity. Juvenile rehabilitation programs bring together those most impacted by the crime—youth involved in the justice system, the victim, and members of the community—in an all over process to promote accountability and meet the needs of the victims and the community in repairing the harm caused by the crime.<sup>24</sup> The Brazilian special courts, a nationwide system established in 1982<sup>25</sup> and staffed by magistrates and professional conciliators, offer the best prospects for a Latin American model of restorative procedures operated as an integral part of the justice system, free and readily available to all. The method operates under the guiding concepts of "simplicity," "informality," and "swiftness," seeking solutions through conciliation "wherever possible." Its strength stems from the magistrates' much increased discretionary authority over conventional courts; because the standards of proof are more in line with common good," and "more in line with the social aims of law."

Mexico is the Latin American nation to consider the implementation of restorative methods most recently. Mexico had just passed a statute establishing restorative justice with amendments made to Article 20 of the constitution, according to the delegation from Mexico to the Commission on Crime Prevention and Criminal Justice's 10th session in 2001 (Delegación 2001). Many new elements have been introduced, like legal assistance, psychological assistance and medical assistance. Although these reforms do not entirely restore the country, they do show that Mexico has a desire for change. Dr. Maria de la Luz Lima discussed the need to develop alternate strategies for settling criminal problems in Mexico at a gathering of attorneys general and judges in 2001.

She urged the creation of criminal mediation as a successful and effective means of advancing justice. She also requested that only the most serious

Vashishth / Dudeja / Teena

140

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>24</sup> Available at: <u>https://ojjdp.ojp.gov/model-programs-guide/literature-reviews/</u> restorative-justice-for-juveniles

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>25</sup> Gerry Johnstone and Daniel W. Van Ness, Handbook of Restorative Justice, 507 (2007).

crimes be punished with prison. Mexican justice authorities who attended this meeting made a strong plea for alternative procedures, demonstrating their understanding that a focus on punishment obstructs the healing of victims and the reintegration of criminals. NGOs are attempting to spread the techniques while the Mexican government advocates for restorative justice principles and procedures. Through the Centro de Resolución de Conflictos, the Fundación Centro de Atención para Victimas del Delito, or Foundation Center for the Attention of Victims of Crime, the government aims to instill a mediation culture in Mexico (Center for Conflict Resolution).

In 1993, CENAVID was established to offer assistance to crime victims, particularly women and children. In one of Guadalajara's most violent areas, CENAVID launched a project in 1995 to promote ADR techniques as a nonviolent means of addressing interpersonal, familial, and societal problems. They started with educational talks and training for both adults and kids. Information on how victims of violence and their families should be treated was included in the session. The Parroquia del Señor de la Misericordia, a local Catholic Church, finally took over the initiative, and CENAVID continued its training. The other duties of CENAVID include providing training to government employees and justice authorities all around Mexico, promoting ADR and mediation, and offering advice on setting up mediation centers.

In Latin America, restorative justice has been implemented in various countries, including Brazil, Colombia, and Chile. In Colombia, the restorative justice system for juveniles is known as "restorative circles." These circles involve the offender, the victim, and the community members who work together to address the harm caused by the offense.

In Brazil, the Juvenile Justice Statute provides for the implementation of restorative justice measures, including mediation and community service. However, the implementation of these measures has been limited due to a lack of resources and a focus on punitive measures.

Challenges faced in Latin America include the lack of funding for restorative justice programs and the high levels of violence and social inequality. These factors make it difficult to implement restorative justice measures effectively. So, it is evident that India and Latin American Countries like Mexico follow the same principle to implement a restorative justice system in their respective countries. Plea Bargaining, ADR, mediation and many more methods have been adopted by countries to promote restorative justice in their systems. Some countries even adopted amendments in their constitution to give valid assent to this practice.

# X. A Comparative Study with Latin American System

Restorative justice and juvenile justice are two important concepts in the field of criminal justice. In India, the juvenile justice system is governed by the Juvenile Justice (Care and Protection of Children) Act, 2015, while restorative justice is not yet widely recognized as a formal system. In contrast, several Latin American countries have incorporated restorative justice principles into their criminal justice systems, with varying levels of success.

One of the main differences between the Indian and Latin American approaches to restorative justice is the extent to which it is recognized and implemented. While some Latin American countries have made significant strides in adopting restorative justice principles, it remains a relatively new concept in India. In addition, the Indian juvenile justice system places a greater emphasis on rehabilitation and reintegration of young offenders, whereas some Latin American countries have focused more on punishment and deterrence.

Another key difference is the role of the community in the restorative justice process. In Latin America, there is often a strong emphasis on community involvement and participation in resolving conflicts and repairing harm caused by crime. This is reflected in the use of community-based dispute resolution mechanisms such as neighborhood courts and indigenous justice systems. In India, however, the role of the community is less well-defined, with most juvenile justice proceedings taking place within the formal court system.

Despite these differences, there are also some similarities between the Indian and Latin American approaches to restorative justice and juvenile justice. For example, both recognize the importance of taking into account the specific needs and circumstances of young offenders, and both prioritize the protection of children's rights and welfare. Additionally, both systems recognize the importance of addressing the underlying social and economic factors that contribute to juvenile delinquency.

Overall, while there are some similarities and differences between the Indian and Latin American systems of restorative justice and juvenile justice, there is no one-size-fits-all approach to these complex issues. Each country must consider its own unique cultural, social, and political context in order to develop effective and appropriate solutions for dealing with juvenile offenders and repairing harm caused by crime.

#### **XI.** Conclusion

In conclusion, while both India and Latin American countries have recognized the importance of restorative justice for juveniles, there are significant challenges to its implementation. These challenges include a lack of resources, training, and awareness, as well as social and economic inequality. To effectively implement restorative justice measures, governments must prioritize funding and training for justice professionals and increase public awareness about the benefits of restorative justice. In order to administer justice, the legal system must be updated to reflect today's fast-paced society and the changes that modernization and technology bring. Despite the devout adherence to the criminal justice system in India, it is past time for the country's legal system to incorporate

142

Vashishth / Dudeja / Teena

restorative justice to a greater level. Therefore, the authorities and parties to a dispute should do everything necessary to determine if a hybrid of both judicial systems can be used in situations where incarnation is required. Additionally, the legal system ought to be able to raise public knowledge of restorative justice among the public. Raising this kind of society awareness is facilitated by national websites, legal counsel, and others. Esta revista forma parte del acervo de la Biblioteca Jurídica Virtual del Instituto de Investigaciones Jurídicas de la UNAM http://www.juridicas.unam.mx/ https://biblio.juridicas.unam.mx/bjv https://revistas.juridicas.unam.mx/ DOI: https://doi.org/10.22201/iij.24485306e.2024.2.18895